



ISO/TC145-IEC/SC3C JWG 11 N 145A

ISO
ORGANISATION INTERNATIONALE DE NORMALISATION
INTERNATIONAL ORGANIZATION FOR STANDARDIZATION

IEC
COMMISSION ÉLECTROTECHNIQUE INTERNATIONALE
INTERNATIONAL ELECTROTECHNICAL COMMISSION

Title:	Revised Combined compilation of comments on IEC/2CD 80416-3 Amendment 1.0 Edition 1.0
Source:	Convener / Project Leader
Status:	Information
Date:	2010-02-04

This document replaced doc JWG 11 N 145 dated 2010-01-04 that was open for review till 2010-01-29.

Document 2CD on Project IEC 80416-3 Amd. 1.0 Ed. 1.0 was distributed among IEC and ISO members using IEC doc 3C/1638/CD and ISO doc TC 145/SC 3 N 224, comments on which were closed on 2009-12-04 and 2009-12-15, respectively.

ISO comments were delayed and received on 2009-12-30. All received comments of IEC/SC 3C National Committees and ISO TC 145/SC 3 secretariat (ANSI) were compiled as attached.

Each of the received comments was observed by Project Leader for IEC 80416-3 Amd. 1 Ed. 1 (as well as convener for Joint WG 11 between ISO TC 145/SC 3 – IEC TC 3/SC 3C) as written in the rightmost column. **The draft observation was discussed by all members of the JWG 11 and revised as attached for consideration of the parent committees.**

Attachment

Annex

Date 2010-02-04	Document 3C/1638/CD	Project Nr. IEC 80416-3 Amd.1 Ed 1.0
--------------------	------------------------	--------------------------------------------

National Committee	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph Figure/ Table	Type of comment (General/ Technical/Editorial)	COMMENTS	Proposed change	OBSERVATIONS OF THE SECRETARIAT on each comment submitted
ISO TC 145/SC 3		2		ed	The title of the 3rd edition of ISO 7000 includes "Index and synopsis". However, ISO 7000 (like IEC 60417) is now a database standard. The title should be simply "Graphical symbols for use on equipment". And should not identification of both ISO 7000 and IEC 60417 as database standards be made?	Revise title of ISO 7000 to "Graphical symbols for use on equipment". Include reference to availability of ISO 7000 and IEC 60417 in database form.	Not accepted for the time being. According to ISO Catalogue, the official and correct designation of ISO 7000 Edition 3 is " <i>ISO 7000:2004, Graphical symbols for use on equipment -- Index and synopsis</i> "; the current stage code is 90.60. ISO Concept Database was also referring to ISO 7000:2004. Availability of IEC 60417 and ISO 7000 published in database format had been informed using other means by IEC CO and ISO CS.
GB		6.1	Para following g).	Editorial	The phrase "... it may be necessary and allowed ..." implies "... it may be allowed ..." which is does not make sense in this context. It is sufficient to say that these adjustments may be necessary without stressing that the adjustments are allowed. (There is no recommendation or requirement in this or any other standard restricting the adjustment of the relative sizes or positions of graphical symbols.)	Change the phrase "... it may be necessary and allowed to adjust ..." to "... it may be necessary to adjust ...".	JWG 11 was asked to discuss this proposal together with the one from ISO TC 145/SC 3 below. Taking into recommendation of JWG 11, an improved wording would be " can be necessary and is permitted ".
ISO TC 145/SC 3		6.1	2nd full paragraph (after alpha items)	ed	Wording of this paragraph is awkward in English. According the ISO/IEC Directives, the verb "may" means "is allowed" or "is permitted".	Revise: If several graphical symbols are applied together, it can be necessary and it is allowed to adjust their relative sizes and positions....	See the observation on GB above. Revised wording would be "If several graphical symbols are applied together, it can be necessary and is permitted to adjust their relative sizes and positions..."

National Committee	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph Figure/ Table	Type of comment (General/ Technical/Editorial)	COMMENTS	Proposed change	OBSERVATIONS OF THE SECRETARIAT on each comment submitted
ISO TC 145/SC 3		6.1	g)	te	This modification contradicts the form and use of arrows defined in ISO 80416-2, Basic principles for graphical symbols for use on equipment – Part 2: Form and use of arrows	Delete item g) to modify the type of arrow in 6.1, Modification according to design	JWG 11 was asked to review the proposal. The proposal was not accepted, because (1) the most parts of ISO 80416-2 are recommendations provided by the verbal form “should”; and (2) IEC 80416-3 covers the guidelines for the adaptation of graphical symbols that have been created and registered in accordance with IEC80416-1.
JP-1		6.6			JNC thinks that inconsistency between IEC 80416-1, ISO 80416-2, IEC 80416-3 and ISO 80416-4 should not be had. But clause 6,6: Modification of arrow type negates ISO 80416-2 clause 4.2. Figure 5 (b) and (c) are inappropriate examples. Therefore clause 6,6: modification of arrow type should be deleted or consistency examples with ISO 80416-2 should be replaced. (but JNC has not good examples) And Figure 9 should be kept for good example.		JWG 11 was asked to review the comment together with the proposal of ISO TC 145/SC 3 below. Taking into account recommendation of JWG 11, the comment was not accepted, because it was a repeated comment already discussed in JWG 11. See the observation on JP-02 (IEC) in 3C/1633A/CC on 1CD 3C/1625/CD. Regarding (original) Figure 9 (in IEC 80416-3 Ed.1), the comment was accepted.
ISO TC 145/SC 3		6.6		te	This modification contradicts the form and use of arrows defined in ISO 80416-2, Basic principles for graphical symbols for use on equipment – Part 2: Form and use of arrows	Delete 6.6 Modification of arrow type and Figure 5 accordingly	Already covered. The same ISO TC 145/SC 3 comment on 6.1.

National Committee	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph Figure/ Table	Type of comment (General/ Technical/Editorial)	COMMENTS	Proposed change	OBSERVATIONS OF THE SECRETARIAT on each comment submitted
ISO TC 145/SC 3		9.2		ed	The verb "may" is a permission word. The verb "can" is a possibility or capability word. In this case, the apparently intended meaning is possibility or capability, not permission. It is not that the meaning of a graphical symbol is allowed to depend upon its orientation. It is possible (indeed, it is a fact) that the meaning of a graphical symbol does depend upon its orientation. Therefore, "can" is the correct verb.	Revise: The meaning of a graphical symbol can depend upon its orientation....	Accepted. ISO/IEC Directives, Part 2, Tables H.3 and H.4 apply.